





Climate Change and UK Fisheries – perceptions of risk and possible adaptation options

John K. Pinnegar, Miranda Jones and Paul Buckley Marine Climate Change Centre, Cefas, Lowestoft, UK

Session W5, Moving towards climate-ready fishery systems, Sun 22nd Mar 2015





The North Sea – a 'hot spot' of climate change.....



One of 20 sites identified by Hobday & Pecl (2013) as having warmed the fastest





Observed 'northward' distribution shifts

Temperature response



Winners & Losers



Abundance response to temperature

72% of the fish species have responded to warming by changing distribution and abundance (Simpson et al. 2011)

Centres of distribution have generally shifted by **distances ranging from 48 to 403 km** (Perry et al. 2005).

The North Sea demersal fish assemblage deepened by ~3.6 m per decade between 1980 and 2004 (Dulvy et al. 2008).

Catches (1913–2007) of cod, haddock, plaice and sole have all shifted distribution albeit **not in a consistent way** (Engelhard et al. 2011).

In the UK we have witnessed both "winners" and "losers"





The UK Climate Change Act (2008)

A legally binding long-term framework to cut carbon emissions.

It also created a framework for building the UK's ability to adapt to climate change, including:

- 1. a UK wide climate change risk assessment that must take place every five years
- 2. a national adaptation programme which must be put in place every five years to address the most pressing climate change risks to England
- 3. Powers to direct "reporting authorities" to prepare reports on how they are acting on the risks and opportunities from a changing climate.







ECR (Economics of Climate Resilience)



This study included a detailed assessment of whether or not the UK fish catching sector can adapt to the opportunities (and threats) associated with future climate change.

Used the analyses of Jones et al. (2012, 2013)

The ECR focussed on species increasing in the UK EEZ, such as anchovy, squid, seabass, scallops, boarfish, and hake.

"is there a case for further intervention to deliver effective adaptation given the current context"?







Projected changes in fish distribution...



Projected change (in km) in latitudinal centroids from 1985 to 2050 across species distribution models and climatic datasets for a) pelagic species and b) demeral species (from Defra 2013).

The ensemble projections suggested northward shifts at an average rate of 27 km per decade (the current rate is around 20km per decade for common fish in the North Sea, Dulvy et al. 2008).

The species predicted to move the furthest and fastest were squid, red mullet, seabass, anchovy and sardine

UK waters will become more hospitable for these species

(based on analyses by Miranda Jones)





Expanding fisheries in recent years.....







Emerging seabass & squid fisheries

In 1984 only 210 tonnes of seabass were landed by countries surrounding the North Sea and English Channel, compared to 2243 tonnes in 2013

Recent evidence (ICES 2012) suggests that the increase may have slowed slightly over the past 3 years, as a result of successive cold winters with resulting poor recruitment

International landings of squid have risen from 375 tonnes in 1980 to 4527 tonnes in 2013

Off north-east Scotland, more boats are now trawling for squid than they do for the region's traditional target species, such as haddock and cod (Hastie et al., 2009)







ECR (Economics of Climate Resilience)

The key adaptation actions the UK fishing industry is likely to make include:

- 1. Travelling further to fish for current species, if stocks move away from UK ports.
- 2. Diversifying the livelihoods of port communities, this may include recreational fishing
- **3.** Increasing vessel capacity if stocks of currently fished species increase.
- 4. Changing gear to fish for different species, if new or more profitable opportunities are available.
- 5. Developing routes to export markets to match the changes in catch supplied.
- 6. Stimulating domestic demand through joined up retailer and media campaigns.









Consumer tastes and preferences

Most of the fish we eat in the UK we <u>import</u> and most of the fish we catch we <u>export</u>.

There is clear maladaptation, in that consumers continue to demand 'traditional species' (e.g. cod) and we obtain these from countries further North (Iceland and Norway).

We sell the fish/shellfish we catch (e.g. *Nephrops* and mackerel) to countries further south who have a tradition of eating these species.



Hugh Fernley-Whittingstall (TV chef) promoting the 'mackerel bap' in 2012



In 2011 the supermarket Sainsbury's ran a campaign "switch the fish". This initiative challenged the supermarket's customers to try an "alternative" fin-fish species.

Sainsbury's reported an annual increase of sea bass sales of 57%

People also often chose sea bass when they eat out as it is seen as more exclusive than cod. However, it is not seen as an everyday food.





Recommended interventions

- A. Enhance the capability to monitor new and more abundant species, involving collaborative working of fishing vessel operators with the scientific community.
- B. Use appropriate existing communication channels to engage with vessel operators and embed learning in relation to best-practice fishing behaviours for new, or more abundant, species.
- C. Examine methods to increase the flexibility with which vessels can adapt, for example by trading quota across operators of all sizes of vessel (large and small).
- D. Proactively support the diversification of consumer demand through the provision of information to consumers about a wider range of fish species and through marketing.













The Challenge of managing across international borders...



- •27 countries are part of the EU and are subject to the EU Common Fisheries Policy (CFP)
- •Fisheries agreements also exist with neighbouring countries e.g. Norway, Iceland and Russia
- The CFP allows common access to all EU waters, but quotas are set according to 'relative stability'
- •TACs vary each year but proportions allocated to each country are fixed in perpetuity!





The current debate about North Atlantic Mackerel.....

In 2011 Iceland and the Faeroe Islands claimed quota for mackerel (46%), since the species had suddenly attained high abundance in their territorial waters.

EU countries accusing Iceland and the Faeroe Islands of threatening stock sustainability.

There has also been a threatened retaliatory embargo on imports of all fish products from these countries

Such disagreements may become more common place in the future

(see talk by Leif Nøttestad, day 1)









EU CLOSES MACKEREL FISHERY TO NORWEGIANS Norway's pelagic fleet exceeds its quota so stopped from fishing westerm mackerel in North Sea – report page 3



vessels in EU waters

And Standing and S





Anchovy – who should be granted access?

Anchovy stocks are depleted in the Bay of Biscay, but are increasing further north

Political negotiations are underway to determine whether Spanish and French vessels should be allowed to operate in areas where previously they had no quota.

Petigas et al. (2012) carried out an analysis to determine *"is it the same anchovy or something different"*?

Concluded that these anchovy are a distinct remnant sub-stock rather than an invasion of animals from the south.

According to the rules, Spanish and French vessels have no 'track record' and so would not necessarily be granted access.









Boarfish – the race to develop 'track record'





Boarfish (*Capros aper*) appeared in very large numbers throughout the NE Atlantic in 1989/1990

In the past boarfish outbreaks had been linked to storms and variability in offshore climate (Cooper 1952).

Fishery landings have grown from <120 t in 2001, to >139 000 t in 2010.

The fishery has been described as an 'Olympic Fishery' as countries race to develop a <u>track record</u>

In 2012, Irish Ministers began negotiations with Chinese seafood companies with regard to exporting for human consumption





Industry perceptions about CC risk and exposure.....





Department for Environment Food & Rural Affairs



Marine Climate Change Impacts Partnership Aims to "support the UK seafood industry to develop a managed adaptive approach to climate change"

Comprised a literature review, substantive collaboration with the industry, 15 semistructured interviews and 3 workshops

Considered all aspects of climate change (temperature, storminess, sea level rise, ocean acidification etc.)

Covered both domestic and international

Priority risks were identified in terms of: (1) confidence, (2) proximity, (3) severity, (4) possible adaptation actions





Some quotes...



"The governance systems we have are too rigid. Governance is not well placed to provide routes for the industry to adapt – it's adding to the problems" Robert Stevenson - Fish Producers Organisation



"In the long term the processing sector needs to find new markets that will absorb the changing product" Will Clark, Fish Merchants Association

"We're fortunate just now as there's a large share of valuable stock in UK waters. However if this were to change, then this would require changes to access rights if the fish shifted (back) to the Norwegian sector". Ian Gatt – Pelagic Fishermen's Association





'Choke species'...

In October 2014 the EU introduced a ban on discarding and thus a requirement to land all fish caught.

Once the least plentiful quota - the "choke species"—is exhausted, the whole fishery must cease operation

Hake, a warm-water species, has witnessed a dramatic increase in biomass between 2004 and 2011, and has recolonized the North Sea where it had largely been absent for over 50 years.

Low quota for hake in the North Sea will become a limiting factor, that may result in premature closure of the entire demersal mixed fishery











Climate change is not just about temperature.....

Projections of future storminess are very uncertain, but generally for the UK we expect more frequent, severe storms

During the winter of 2013/2014 strong storm events had devastating consequences for the inshore fishing industry.

Many vessels were tied up in port for more than 5 months, with implications for revenues, profits and local economies and damage to both onshore infrastructure and to the fishing vessels themselves.

The winter of 2013/14 was the stormiest in the last 66-years (Matthews et al. 2014)





Storms send Newlyn fish prices rocketing



have been trapped on land as ferocious sti Related Stories rall's coast may risk sailing in dangerous cond ing organisation has warned.

Fan market stods have led to scaring p cers Organisation (CFPO) said that could tempt skippe

As a result some wholesate prices have nearly double

oney 'no object fo od relief wals of shores



Sour II C = A

BBC O Sign in

Cornwall fishermen make plea over lost lobster pots



ornwall are calling for help with the cost of re **Related Stories** ids of crab and lobster pots missing or damaged in the storms

ny have been restricted to just a few days fishing since December and

ey face potentially crippling bills to replace their lost or damaged



Storm-hit fishing fleets 'facing financial crisis'



thousands of pounds every dai

Related Stories

shermen count the posts of storms ms send fish pr





Some Conclusions...

Table 7. Summary of organisational adaptive capacity

Fleet	Enablers to adaptation	Barriers to adaptation	Policy barriers	Overall capacity to adapt
In-shore	 Currently fish mixed species. Low operating costs. Supply niche markets in the UK (restaurants and local fishmongers). Net replacements rates for investments. 	 Cannot travel far. Decisions can be dominated by short-term considerations. Generally not represented by producer organisations (may be part of associations). Many based in small ports where access to export markers can be an issue. 	 Cannot trade quotas between themselves. Threat of losing shellfish licence if change away from shellfish. More easily displaced by MPZs. 	Are versatile and opportunistic, yet restricted to opportunities that come to them.
Demersal and beam trawlers	 Currently fish mixed species. Will need to have replaced nets within the next 20 years of species change. May have more incentive to change if current fishing low profit species. Fishing for species all year round. 	 Northern fleets fishing cod have low profitability. High operating and fuel costs restrict ability to travel further or invest in new gear. Vessels only suitable for demersal species. 	 Likely to fish in cod or sole areas, so face quota and effort restrictions. 	Incentivised not to travel further for current species but will face strongest policy and capacity barriers to changing species.
Pelagic	 Profitable so likely to have investment finance options. Fish seasonally, so may have off-season underutilised capacity. Larger vessels and ability to travel further. No time at sea restrictions. Currently export a large amount of stock – not reliant on the UK market for demand. Their supply chain also work seasonally so may have underutilised capacity. 	 Tend to target one species at a time. Pelagic species can move and change quickly. 	 Typically profitable species, limited by quota allocations to the UK. Large ships which need enough quota allocation to make the industry viable. 	Currently the vessels are profitable so have capacity but lack incentive.





MCCIP Fish, Fisheries & Aquaculture Card 2012



In May 2012 MCCIP launched a 'special topic' report card on fish, fisheries and aquaculture

<section-header><section-header><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></section-header></section-header>	ologoni (Josev Taniman Judoparland	Mar Andrig Distant II. Min Min (2015) 1 May 2015 in Milly (Hung Linny Annound, 1997–13 MIC/vp. (199	
<section-header><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></section-header>	Review of climate change i	impacts on marine fisheries in th and Ireland	te UK
<text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text>	MILLION & L. CHITCHIPALA IN		
<text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text>	¹ Subscine Dimensional ¹ Cause Sin Enclosument Faile ¹ Philarke Comm. The Land ⁴ Philarke Comm. The Land	ALLARY COMMUNIC	NYE MARKET AND REPORTED BELLEVILLE
<text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text>		Published and Debugsion	And Media Levelan and An Antonia Leveland In 7 May 2003 in Weby Online Lebenry (International) (INTERNATION 2014
<text><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text>	 Conversional Robust in an improve Conversion conversional in improve administration and lead to conversion and and 30 The American Conversion Continue Robust conversions planter changes, the context 		
<text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text>	 Guarge augering to resulting to start fails about and underfoling means arms army potential impacts on failurely read it Theore dampio may have built by balant in the terrelation degrees in theorem. 	Review of clumate change around	e impacts on marine jish and shelfish the UK and leeland
<text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text>	regulations, the map of 6th pendrast - is the UK and both filters	NICHAEL R. HEATH?*, FRANCIS C. NEAT	, JOHN K. PINNEGAR', DAVID G. REDP, DAVID W. SIMP ¹ and PTTR 1. MEMOUT ¹
<text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text>	For charing information in the 10% and for matters to common schemer. Reserves, a	⁴ Outwesty of Strathelysle, Department of Mathew ⁹ Marine Scotland - Science, Marine Lab	
<text><section-header><text><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></section-header></text>	Relay actives, particularly these means Cosynakt C. 2012 July: Wiley & Sone	Celter, J "Marian Jun	
<section-header><text><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text></section-header>	Represent & Gaugine 295 (1) Revised TMD	¹ Ocean and Earth Science, National Oceanog	success or an end of the second second second second second
<section-header><section-header><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></section-header></section-header>			- Lamanda V Homeson - Malay - Mandalow (Francess 12): VIII - 42, 53 (2017) - Haddening continger - Malay - 404 (2012) on Welley For data C, Karana
<footnote><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></footnote>	INTRODUCTION	1. Ream and restanted fames sheep	redupation/financestic DOI 161002-april 16"
<text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text>	interested in Arris 1: but here cannot inter	farland are hoving, and will in the faits	
<text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text>	ativity in cassal regions of the U.K.	adaptation, habitat slowed ency and th	
<text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text>	aplant. Sorthint, Wales, Northern 1 (Max and its Chapter Island/Card)	may be only partially applyined by sim 2. Three is a broad body of evidence	Review of elimete change impacts on maxine assured tors in the UK
<text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text>	class). In 2010, total landings of lich a	distributions and abandances, which federal Diamer name orchody, and en-	and beland
<text><text></text></text>	int the UK, and this frequent were to	los abandant. However, the changes in	
 Mark (mark) (mark) (mark) Mark (mark) (mark) (mark) Mark (mark) (mark) (mark) (mark) Mark (mark) (mark) (mark) (mark) (mark) (mark) Mark (mark) (mark) (mark) (mark) (mark) (mark) (mark) (mark) Mark (mark) (ma	Communication of William W.L. Chrone Palance	southern water spusies into the North-	
<text><text></text></text>	weit wefenseelde der verbenet	3. The eventual population-scale ango	RUTH CALLAWAY?," ANDREW P. SIERN' SCZANNE T. GRENETCE: JAMES E. BRON', GAVEN BURNELE.
 A. San base starts and starts a	kernale a 2017 Like Ware & West Life	peaker. However, the next in idence on calkifying photonic organisms may be	KEVIN J TUYNN", CLIVE TOX, DARREN M CREEN, GRADME C MAYS, ADAM D JE GREE
 Brain Brain Brai		asflactors on bobaciour with possible p 4. In British waters, the lower sanded	AND SKAT MUNDZU, TIGHTNEKTLI, TOM PICKLEILL, ANDREWT, ROWLET, MICHELS STANLEY
 Britsmann and Kanna Santa Markan Marka		charge. Owing to its strict association compensate for warming na armenta	DOLIGIAS R. TOCHER ¹ /JAMES F. FURNBULL ¹ , GEMMA WEBP ¹¹⁷ , EMMA WEBPTUN ¹ and BOBPN J. SHIELDS ¹ ¹ Dynamics of Biochemics University Context. Summa University: Mighting Park Stramos, SA2 HPT, VK
 Berger Markensen, Berger Markense, Berge Markense, Berger Markense, Berge Marken		reepfantices production to usp produce	¹⁷ Contry for Scientingen Applieb, Records According Contenting: Magdata Park, Sciences, XAT DPR, 835 [Magatamat of Generative Publics of Change Visions Fordients], January 201, Marcad X47 (197), 135
 "Inter the strateging strategin		Reserved 12 Sectoreber 2011, Revised 2	² Statistics of Apparalises Deveryby of Skiller Solids 78742.4.43 considered Educe Development Lange Conserve University of Skiller Solids (Skiller Solid Society Med Loss Advance)
 "A manufacture of the second se		101700000000000000000000000000000000000	"Southin discussion for Manne Sound, South A Martin Martin Martin, Phys. Rep. B 412 (QA-1) E
Englisher under die der geschäftigten under die der geschäftigten under die der geschäftigten der g		the same same regarded as an	¹⁴ School at Ocean Sciences, Amyor University, Manual Bridge, Amstery, JLDV 74B, UK.
 Alter and a second secon			Multion Accounts of Linin Brane Principan Hall Linian Brane Linian (TAR 001, UK
 Marshelm Marshelm Marshelm			ARSTRACT
Couplet C M DA WE & So that		*Compositive is: Mahod R. Heath, University of Struct, Ghagow G1 (XII, TK, E-sual) in heath(para)	surveys tensoriality of the thirds and apportunities of clinical clinical clinical and addition in the VE and branch, because with the new recentredy formed agrees. Har research, (Professional) and Alberts advant California (
 Bendragen & Bernhammer Stern and Ster and Stern and Ster and Ster and Ster and Ster		Converses C. 2012 July: Wiley & Sons, Ltd.	 There is open or character to a characterize characterize a selecting aquacators on the UK and believed interactions during their bars. Party 1996 by descent from second recommendation control for open of
. The provide the invested in the label input for hands In spin to the input is the invested in the label input for hands In spin to the input is an invested input is the input is input is input input is input input is input input is input is input input is i			antestignal decomposite is againing, estimates affine of effects sharp? History, we must of
 A share is existed in size diverse sharehow and there is the sharehow the sharehow			theory association, thereard as the lange grants in change suggests that were the next arrange.
where our Schwitz me will be deriver sind begin like sind auf sind besite sind begin like sind besite sind begin like sind besite si			1 Impacts are stable in the reducing a dependence on the second representation for stability to provide a second secon
Standard Standard Landard Standard S			where capes Seciled me will the double morphology, reducing the areal extra of some industry with pro-
Sec. 2014. Sec. 201			presentedly triggering farmlad upor Morece and negatively effecting Notific farming. In addition manar
and instance of reference particles and particule. All reflects particles are reflection in the first quantitation in the 11 Structure instance of the reflection of the ref			 To and all the second developments and the second se
A functionalism response of a granulation to be even to even the more and the function of the function of the second			and interact of diverses pressive and pickogers, afflexage paracter, and depare in fielder agreedent must be constrained by the pressive and the special of transmission and man-textule residence who pressively damagers.
Comparts (2012) Alle Mellegie en Las. Formal 35 control 2012 factore (15 monto) (15 monto) (12 monto) (12 monto) (12 monto) (12 monto) (12 mo			3 Rises important the making operating to the wave many many and the additional Maker Error, many the optical distribution on their a accention whether theread access and the second
- Journal Weynward (2011 Structure) (2012 - sound) (1910 - 1910) (2014). Second Structure (2014 - 2014) (2014 - 2014) (2014 - 2014 - 2014) (2014 - 2014 - 2014) (2014 - 2014 - 2014) (2014 - 2014) (2014 - 2014 - 2014) (2014 - 2014 - 2014)) (2014 - 2014			Openight / 2012 Anne Wiley is then, but
(c) Unit: a contraction case (doing to consider the doing to constrain the contraction of the contract of t			Hystorich & September 2011 Keynool fri Lithennyy 2012, Australia 10 Minuti 2011
*Composition for & Contrast Processed of Streamond of Theorem Contrast Contrast Contrast Contrast (Contrast Contrast			on here approximation plant comparison in the second s
			"Composition to R. College Department of Discourses, 5 days of Solice Assessed Document Register Fed. Strategie ANT DP, 161
			Press resultance in a second second second





Lots of media coverage:









BBC Wildlife, August 2012



The Guardian, 9th May 2012



Warming Oceans Means Seafood Menu Changes

Warm water species are beginning to appear in the northerly seas around Britain by Jeremy Lovell and ClimateWire ClimateWire

LONDON — The seas around Britain are starting to teem with fish species once deemed exotic as climate change raises water temperatures, forcing the former dominant occupants to flee northward



Scientific American, 2nd July 2012





Fin.....

Acknowledgements:

Dr Miranda Jones Paul Buckley

Dr William Cheung (UBC) Dr Stephen Dye (Cefas & MCCIP)





Department for Environment Food & Rural Affairs



Contact – john.pinnegar@cefas.co.uk